



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

Organisation
des Nations Unies
pour l'éducation,
la science et la culture

World Heritage

43 COM

WHC/19/43.COM/7B.Add.3

Paris, 21 June 2019

Original: English / French

UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION

CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE

WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Forty-third session

Baku, Republic of Azerbaijan
30 June - 10 July 2019

**Item 7B of the Provisional Agenda: State of conservation of properties
inscribed on the World Heritage List**

SUMMARY

This document contains information on the state of conservation of properties inscribed on the World Heritage List. The World Heritage Committee is requested to review the reports on the state of conservation of properties contained in this document. The full reports of Reactive Monitoring missions requested by the World Heritage Committee are available at the following Web address in their original language: <http://whc.unesco.org/en/sessions/43COM/documents>

All previous state of conservation reports are available through the World Heritage State of conservation Information System at the following Web address: <http://whc.unesco.org/en/soc>

Decision required: The World Heritage Committee may wish to adopt the draft Decision presented at the end of each state of conservation report.

Table of content

REPORTS ON THE STATE OF CONSERVATION OF PROPERTIES INSCRIBED ON THE WORLD HERITAGE LIST.....	3
CULTURAL PROPERTIES	3
<i>EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA</i>	3
82. Paris, Bank of the Seine (France) (C 600).....	3
84. Budapest, including the Banks of the Danube, the Buda Castle Quarter and Andrassy Avenue (Hungary) (C 400bis).....	5

REPORTS ON THE STATE OF CONSERVATION OF PROPERTIES INSCRIBED ON THE WORLD HERITAGE LIST

CULTURAL PROPERTIES

EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

82. Paris, Bank of the Seine (France) (C 600)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1991

Criteria (i)(ii)(iv)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger N/A

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/600/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 0

Total amount approved: USD 0

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/600/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

N/A

Previous monitoring missions

N/A

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

Fire at the Notre-Dame Cathedral of Paris on 15 April 2019

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/600/>

Current conservation issues

On 15 April 2019, a fire devastated the Notre-Dame Cathedral of Paris, one of the components of the “Paris, Banks of the Seine” property.

On 5 June 2019, in response to a letter from the World Heritage Centre informing the French State Party of the presentation of a state of conservation report on the property at the 43rd World Heritage Committee session, the State Party submitted an explanatory note on the emergency plan and the immediate measures taken to secure the Cathedral. In this note, the State Party emphasized that the emergency measures undertaken concerned the consolidation and safety of the Cathedral, as well as the protection and care of the movable objects. At the time of preparation of the present report, these measures are still ongoing.

The Historical Monuments Research Laboratory and the Centre for Research and Restoration of Museums of France are mobilized to oversee the work site and bring their expertise on the soundness of the stones that have fallen or are still in place, the evolution of the hygrometry in the building and the risk control of micro-organism development. The State Party also confirms that thanks to the very targeted actions of the fire service and the commitment of the competent services, no major art work was destroyed by the fire, and few movable objects suffered from water damage resulting from the extinction of the fire. However, the State Party underlined that due to a current judicial investigation to determine the origin of the fire and the state of the vault, the specialized teams are unable to access all parts of the building to make a full report of the damage.

In addition, the State Party informed that it will be able to submit a state of conservation report on the building on 1 December 2019.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

It is noted that the fire of 15 April 2019 caused major damage, notably the vault of the building and that the assessment of this damage is not completed. Based on current information, it would appear that the essential part of the structure could be preserved. It is noted with satisfaction that the evacuation of the treasures of the Cathedral was successfully accomplished.

The World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS have taken note of the initial measures undertaken by the State Party to establish optimal conservation and restoration conditions for the building, in particular the launch of a national fund, the creation of a public establishment to manage the funds raised and the application of a specific legislative mechanism, ordinances, to facilitate the completion of the restoration work.

The World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS recall that the restoration work to be carried out by the State Party must be in conformity with the provisions of the *World Heritage Convention*. In this respect, it is recommended that the Committee remind the State Party to inform the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies (ICOMOS, ICCROM) of proposals for restoration projects for the building, in conformity with paragraph 172 of the *Operational Guidelines*.

In close coordination with ICOMOS and ICCROM, UNESCO has made available three experts to assist the State Party, in case of need.

As committed by the State Party, it is further recommended that the Committee request the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2019, a detailed report on the state of conservation of the Cathedral and the measures envisaged for its consolidation, conservation and restoration of the damaged parts, with a view to initiating a dialogue on the general restoration process for the building and particularly opportunities for the enhancement of traditional savoir-faire.

Draft Decision: 43 COM 7B.82

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/19/43.COM/7B.Add.3,
2. Expresses its solidarity with the State Party for the damage caused to the Notre-Dame Cathedral of Paris, a component of the “Paris, Banks of the Seine”, by the fire on 15 April 2019;
3. Takes note of the information provided by the State Party concerning the emergency plan and the immediate measures already carried out to secure the Cathedral, and commends the State Party for the efforts undertaken by the competent national authorities to ensure the safeguarding of the property despite the difficulties encountered;
4. Invites the State Party, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, to inform the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies (ICOMOS, ICCROM) of proposals for consolidation, conservation and restoration projects of the damaged parts of the Cathedral, before irreversible decisions are taken, and encourages the State Party, in conformity with the Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, to initiate a dialogue with the Committee to identify appropriate solutions to ensure the preservation of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property;
5. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2019**, as it has committed, a detailed report on the state of conservation of the property for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 44th session in 2020.

84. Budapest, including the Banks of the Danube, the Buda Castle Quarter and Andrásy Avenue (Hungary) (C 400bis)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1987

Criteria (ii)(iv)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger N/A

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/400/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 0

Total amount approved: USD 0

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/400/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount provided: 800 million HUF (ca. 2.7 million EUR) EU support for the “Street of Culture” project

Previous monitoring missions

March 2005: World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Advisory mission; November 2007, February 2018: ICOMOS Advisory missions; February 2013, April 2019: joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Demolition and inappropriate development in the buffer zone known as the ‘Jewish Quarter’
- Inappropriate use of public areas and street amenities
- Lack of conservation of residential housing in the area inscribed as World Heritage
- Effects arising from use of transportation infrastructure (increased traffic volume)

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/400/>

Current conservation issues

On 27th February 2019, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report. An executive summary of this report is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/400bis/documents>. An ICOMOS Advisory mission visited the property from 4 to 8 February 2018. The State Party submitted the comments on the mission report, which is not yet publically available. A joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission visited the property from 28 to 30 April 2019. The report of this mission is pending ICOMOS peer review and will be available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/400bis/documents>.

The State Party report addresses some of the recommendations of the Committee and those of the 2018 mission. It reported that a new heritage conservation organisational structure has been introduced with further improvement envisaged, although at this stage this only relates to domestic heritage, as well as that an enlargement to the buffer zone is planned. It noted that the funds necessary for preparing the Management Plan are now available and that the document could be completed by 2021.

The 2018 mission reviewed and analyzed all the documentation (available in working languages) for all revised, planned, ongoing or implemented major projects submitted by the State Party. These included the National Hauszmann Plan for the restoration/reconstruction of the Buda Castle Quarter, the “Liget Budapest Project”, and proposals for high-rise buildings in the setting of the property.

Buda Castle quarter: In 2016, the State Party submitted a brief report on the National Hauszmann Plan, which is a masterplan for the rehabilitation, revitalization and partial reconstruction of the Buda Castle Quarter. This Plan, that has continued to develop, includes the reconstruction of buildings that were damaged and demolished as a result of the Second World War as well as some partially re-built during the Communist era. As requested by ICOMOS, in 2017, the State Party submitted an HIA of the Plan in English along with a number of explanatory notes, drawings, and plans that were in Hungarian. As requested by the Committee, the State Party invited an ICOMOS Advisory mission to review the overall Plan and the HIA. The 2018 mission found that work on implementing the Plan had already commenced

but with an absence of any overall clear and detailed rationale that could offer a justification for the major interventions that were in progress or planned and which had the potential for highly adverse impact on OUV. It requested further details on the overall rationale for the Plan and for these to be submitted (in working languages) for review. The State Party reported that construction work has continued, in particular on the Carmelite Monastery, Riding School, Main Guards building, Stöckl stairs, and on proposed projects for St Stephen's Hall, and the Ministries of Interior and Finance. The State Party also reported support for enlarging the buffer zone to include Margaret Island, and the area west of the Buda Castle Quarter.

Liget Budapest Project: An HIA for this project within Városliget Park in the buffer zone, involving the reconstruction and construction of new public buildings such as the Museum of Ethnography and the Biodome, was submitted as part of the State Party report. The 2018 mission had expressed concerns at the potential impact of this extensive project and recommended that work on the Biodome should be halted. The State Party reported that the projects for the Museum of Ethnography and the Biodome do not need amending and appear not to have been stopped. The 2019 mission observed that the HIA submitted by the State Party needed to conform to the ICOMOS guidelines and be based on verifiable data which currently is not the case.

High-rise buildings: The 2018 mission noted that in general there is potential for negative impact from high rise buildings in the setting of the property which, at the time of the mission, could be erected up to 120 metres high. It recommended that the State Party stop any permits for high-rise building in the 11th District and that HIAs of projects should be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review. The State Party reported that, as an impact on the property's OUV is minimal, a permit for construction of the 120 metre high MOL Campus building in District 11 was issued in February 2018. The State Party also reported that new stricter regulations were introduced in July 2018 that requires buildings higher than 65 meters to receive the planning council's approval on the 'architectural and technical plan documentation'. However, it is clearly stated that the permission for the MOL building cannot be reversed. A detailed study of the impact of high-rise buildings on OUV of the property is planned for District 11.

The 2019 mission observed a number of other projects, new developments as well as reconstruction works ongoing in the property and buffer zone for which the World Heritage Centre had no previous information, including a demolition at 52 Paulay Ede Street and a renovation of the Opera house.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

Some progress has occurred with implementation of the Committee's Decisions, including the introduction of a new heritage conservation organisational structure, availability of funds for the elaboration of the Management Plan, new Law restricting the height of buildings from 120 m to 65 meters. However, key steps are yet to be achieved, particularly the development and approval of a City development plan for the entire urban landscape, including the stringent regulations for assessment of the potential impact of proposed projects on the OUV, as well as an overall and comprehensive Management Plan. The integration of the Management Plan with a comprehensive city development plan following the approach of the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape is essential.

It is noted that no single office, person, or authority had an overview of the complete list of all projects ongoing and proposed, in the property and its buffer zone. The absence of adequate governance for World Heritage, including a site manager or authority over the entire property and its buffer zone to ensure clear management of the property based on its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), which requires permanent interaction among all stakeholders, is an important factor of risk for World Heritage properties. The 2018 ICOMOS Advisory mission was undertaken in response to concerns by the Committee in 2017 at number of large-scale development projects proposed at Buda Castle within the property, in Városliget Park within the buffer zone and in the 11th District within the wider setting of the property. It is recommended that the Committee express its concern regarding the lack of an appropriate approach for the ongoing and proposed works being undertaken as part of the Hauszmann Plan for the Buda Castle Quarter which involves substantial reconstruction and new construction of the Royal Palace and adjoining civic district and represents a specific and imminent threat. The general policy to reconstruct buildings or parts that have been destroyed during World War II or in the Communist period in order to recover an idealized older history is leading to an important and cumulative loss of authenticity of the property. The blurring of the distinctions between conservation, restoration, reconstruction, and new construction is not in line with the principles of international norms and standards. The cumulative impact of these reconstruction activities presents a danger to the OUV of the property, especially its

authenticity. The Committee is invited to request the State Party to halt all ongoing and planned works and to consider and develop an alternative approach to conservation and development, supported by appropriate policies and conservation plans and to submit these for review and approval before work re-commences in order to prevent any further threats to the OUV of the property, and to its authenticity and integrity.

It is recommended that the Committee express its concern regarding the potential impact of extensive developments within the Liget Budapest project, as well as to invite the State Party to submit all additional documents and clarifications requested by the 2018 and 2019 missions, including for the HIA of the Museum of Ethnography. It recommended that if the revised verifiable HIA shows an adverse visual impact on the property, mitigation measures should be examined and implemented.

It is also recommended that the Committee invite the State Party to halt any permits for high-rise building in the 11th District and that HIAs of projects should be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review. It is noted that numerous documents, projects and drawings have been submitted to the World Heritage Centre only in Hungarian. This does not allow review and feedback by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies. Moreover, HIAs and analysis need to be in conformity with ICOMOS guidelines.

The April 2019 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission, which followed previous missions, including the 2018 ICOMOS Advisory mission, found that the state of conservation of the property is impacted by negative factors which represent potential threats to the OUV of the property. The 2019 mission found that compounded together, the numerous unsolved issues, the blurring of the distinctions between conservation, restoration, reconstruction, and new construction in addition to the speed of the development work ongoing, collectively and cumulatively impact the authenticity and integrity of the property adversely.

The progress made by the State Party is acknowledged but is not sufficient to address the ongoing threats to the integrity, authenticity and OUV of the property, as confirmed by the findings of the 2019 mission, which in accordance with Paragraph 179 of the *Operational Guidelines*, considered that the property warrants inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger. It is recommended that the Committee encourage the State Party to explore as a matter of urgency a dialogue with the Advisory Bodies to support the development of alternative approaches to conservation and development in and around the property and its buffer zone and also explore possible mitigation measures.

Draft Decision: 43 COM 7B.84

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/19/43.COM/7B.Add.3,*
2. *Recalling Decision **41 COM 7B.46**, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),*
3. *Acknowledges the progress of the State Party in implementing previous Committee Decisions, but notes with concern that there has been limited progress, that some important matters are yet to be addressed;*
4. *Reiterates its concern that a number of large-scale ongoing and proposed development projects within the property are impacting, and have the potential to impact substantially and adversely, on the OUV of the property;*
5. *Express its concern at the absence of an appropriate approach for the ongoing and proposed reconstruction works including as part of the Hauszmann Plan at the Buda Castle Quarter, as these represent an imminent threat to the property due to the progressive loss of historical authenticity in this element and urges the State Party to halt all ongoing and planned works, and, as a matter of urgency, to consider and develop an alternative approach to conservation and development, supported by appropriate policies and conservation plans, and to submit these for review and approval before work*

re-commencing; and encourages the State Party to engage in dialogue with the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies towards this end;

6. Notes with dismay that the 120 metre high MOL Campus building in District 11 was given permission and urges the State Party to halt any permits for high-rise building in the 11th District and submit HIAs of all planned projects to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
7. Express its concern regarding the potential impact of extensive developments within the Liget Budapest project, and in particular the Museum of Ethnology and the Biodome, and urges the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre all additional documents and clarifications requested by the 2018 and 2019 missions for review by the Advisory Bodies;
8. Notes with regret that the state of conservation of the property is impacted by negative factors which represent potential threats to the OUV of the property and that compounded together, the numerous unsolved issues, the blurring of the distinctions between conservation, restoration, reconstruction, and new construction in addition to the speed of the development work ongoing, collectively and cumulatively impact the authenticity and integrity of the property adversely and therefore considers that without urgent and necessary measures and responses to reorienting the approach to conservation and development, there will remain actual and potential threats to the property in conformity with Paragraph 179 of the Operational Guidelines;
9. Notes the absence of adequate governance for World Heritage and recommends the State Party to ensure clear governance and management of the property based on its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) by establishment of a single site manager or authority over the entire property and its buffer zone,
10. Urges the State Party to:
 - a) Halt further projects for conservation, restoration, and new development in the property and the buffer zone until a management plan integrated with the city development plan, and building guidelines have been prepared, reviewed by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, and adopted,
 - b) Submit all relevant documents including plans, drawings, and HIAs for all ongoing and proposed projects (in working languages - English or French) within the property and the buffer zone to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
 - c) Prepare, finalize, adopt and implement the Management Plan and City Development Plan, based on the OUV of the property, as well as to enforce the existing protection regimes following the approach of the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape;
 - d) Implement fully all the recommendations of the 2019 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission, as well as those of the previous 2018 ICOMOS Advisory mission that are yet to be addressed;
11. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2020**, an updated report, on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 44th session in 2020 **with a view, if no substantial progress is accomplished until then, to consider inscribing the property on the List of the World Heritage in Danger.**